# Appellate Division - First Department

### SUPREME COURT State of New York

### CHRISTOPHER E. DIPASQUALE,

Plaintiff-Appellant,

#### Against

# SECURITY MUTUAL LIFE INSURANCE COMPANY OF NEW YORK, ET AL.,

Defendants-Respondents.

New York County Clerk's No. 122062/02

# BRIEF OF UNITED POLICYHOLDERS, as AMICUS CURIAE in support of PLAINTIFF-APPELLANT

Anderson Kill & Olick, P.C. Attorneys for Amicus Curiae, United Policyholders 1251 Avenue of the Americas New York, New York 10020

Tel: (212) 278-1000 Fax: (212) 278-1733

#### OF COUNSEL:

Eugene R. Anderson, Esq. Anderson Kill & Olick, P.C. 1251 Avenue of the Americas New York, New York 10020

Tel: (212) 278-1000 Fax: (212) 278-1733

Amy Bach, Esq.
United Policyholders
42 Miller Avenue
Mill Valley, CA 94941
Tel: (415) 381-7627

Tel: (415) 381-7627 Fax: (415) 381-5572

# BRIEF OF AMICUS CURIAE IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFF-APPELLANT

This is an appeal from a Decision and Order of the Supreme Court,
New York County (Paula Omansky, J.) dated September 20, 2003 and entered on
October 6, 2003, (R. 3-9)¹ denying plaintiff-appellant, Christopher E. DiPasquale's
("Mr. DiPasquale") motion to vacate a prior motion granted on default. The prior
Decision and Order of the Supreme Court, New York County (Paula Omansky, J.)
dated June 23, 2003 and entered on June 26, 2003, (R. 10-17) granted defendantrespondent, Security Mutual Life Insurance Company of New York's ("Security
Mutual"), motion to dismiss.

The Right Of Access To The Courts To Seek Legal Redress For Injury Is A Fundamental Right and This Right Is Being Denied Mr. DiPasquale.

From our nation's earliest days, this country has recognized the duty of government to provide legal recourse for injury. For instance, the Declaration of Independence states that the King has "pretended legislation...For depriving us, in many cases, of the Benefits of Trial by Jury." Chief Justice Marshall stated:

[T]he very essence of civil liberty certainly consists in the right of every individual to claim the protection of the laws, whenever he receives an injury. One of the first duties of government is to afford that protection.

All citations in the form "(R. \_\_)" are to the Record on Appeal.

Marbury v. Madison, 5 U.S. (1 Cranch) 137, 163 (1803). As United States Supreme Court Justice O'Connor recently held, "[T]he federal interest in ensuring that all citizens have access to the courts is obviously a weighty one." Three Affiliated Tribes of the Fort Berthold Reservation v. Wold Engineering, 476 U.S. 877, 887 (1986) (citations omitted). More recently, the United States Supreme Court confirmed that this right is fundamental and grounded in the Constitution. Christopher v. Harbury, 536 US. 403, 414 n.12 (2002).

The ancient right of access to the courts to seek legal remedy for wrongful injury predates the United States Constitution. Lord Coke traced it to the Magna Carta, and Blackstone declared it to be an "invariable principle in the laws of England, that every right, when withheld, must have a remedy, and every injury it's proper redress." The United States Supreme Court has pronounced it "the duty of every State to provide, in the administration of justice, for the redress of private wrongs" under the Due Process Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment.

Missouri Pacific Ry. Co. v. Humes, 115 U.S. 512, 521 (1885).

### **CONCLUSION**

United Policyholders as Amicus Curiae in support of plaintiffappellant respectfully requests that this Court vacate and reverse the September 30, 2003 Decision and Order of Justice Ormansky and conclude that Mr. DiPasquale's proposed amended complaint has merit and grant him leave to re-plead. Dated: New York, New York August 19, 2004

Eugene R. Anderson

Anderson Kill & Olick, P.C. Attorneys for Amicus Curiae,

United Policyholders

1251 Avenue of the Americas

New York, New York 10020

Tel: (212) 278-1000 Fax: (212) 278-1733

### OF COUNSEL:

Amy Bach, Esq. United Policyholders 42 Miller Avenue Mill Valley, CA 94941

Tel: (415) 381-7627 Fax: (415) 381-5572

### **CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE**

Pursuant to 22 NYCRR § 670.10.3(f)

The foregoing brief was prepared on a computer. A proportionally spaced typeface was used as follows:

Name of Typeface:

Times New Roman

Pont Size:

14

Line Spacing:

Double

The total number of words in the brief, inclusive of point headings and footnotes and exclusive of pages containing the table of contents, table of citations, proof of service, certificate of compliance, or any authorized addendum containing statutes, rules, regulations, etc. is 495.

## Appellate Division - First Department

# SUPREME COURT State of New York

#### CHRISTOPHER E. DIPASQUALE,

Plaintiff-Appellant,

#### Against

# SECURITY MUTUAL LIFE INSURANCE COMPANY OF NEW YORK, ET AL.,

Defendants-Respondents.

New York County Clerk's No. 122062/02

# AFFIRMATION OF EUGENE R. ANDERSON IN SUPPORT OF THE PROPOSED BRIEF OF UNITED POLICYHOLDERS, as AMICUS CURIAE

Anderson Kill & Olick, P.C. Attorneys for Amicus Curiae, United Policyholders 1251 Avenue of the Americas New York, New York 10020 Tel: (212) 278-1000

Fax: (212) 278-1733

#### OF COUNSEL:

Eugene R. Anderson, Esq. Anderson Kill & Olick, P.C. 1251 Avenue of the Americas New York, New York 10020

Tel: (212) 278-1000 Fax: (212) 278-1733

Amy Bach, Esq. United Policyholders 42 Miller Avenue Mill Valley, CA 94941 Tel: (415) 381-7627

Fax: (415) 381-5572

EUGENE R. ANDERSON, being duly sworn, affirms and says:

- 1. I am an attorney with the law firm of Anderson Kill & Olick, P.C., attorneys for <u>amicus curiae</u>, United Policyholders. I make this affirmation in support of United Policyholders' Motion for permission to file a brief as <u>amicus curiae</u>, a copy of which is attached.
  - 2. I am fully familiar with the proceedings in this case.
- 3. United Policyholders is a non-profit corporation dedicated to educating policyholders about their rights and duties under their insurance policies. United Policyholders engages in charitable and educational activities by promoting greater public understanding of insurance issues and policyholder rights. United Policyholders' activities include organizing meetings, distributing written materials, and responding to requests for information from individuals, elected officials, and governmental entities. These activities are limited only to the extent that United Policyholders exists exclusively on donated labor and contributions of services and funds.

Amicus curiae have a vital interest in seeing that policyholders have access to information so they can make informed decisions. As a public interest organization, United Policyholders seeks to assist and to educate the public and the courts about policyholders' insurance rights and to support efforts to have such rights enforced consistently throughout the country.

Eugene R. Andersøn